
CITY OF COLUMBIA
DESIGN / DEVELOPMENT REVIEW COMMISSION

October 13, 2016
Regular Session – 4:00 PM

Minutes
City Hall

Council Chambers • 1737 Main Street • Columbia, SC

Members Present: Paul Bouknight, Harris Cohn, LaToya Grate, Ryan Hyler, John Powell, Robert Wynn

Members Absent: Ashby Gressette, Bowen Horger, Tom Savory

Staff: Amy Moore, Lucinda Statler, Staci Richey, Rachel Walling, John Fellows, Johnathan Chambers, Andrea Wolfe

I. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Robert Wynn at 4:03 PM.

Ms. Moore noted changes to the agenda since publication.

II. CONSENT AGENDA

**URBAN
HISTORIC**

1. **142 Edisto Avenue** (TMS#R11310-03-01) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes and preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. *Wales Garden Architectural Conservation District*
2. **2241 Marion Street** (TMS# 09113-11-01) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for addition, exterior changes and for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. *Cottontown Architectural Conservation District*
3. **923-25 Gervais Street** (TMS#09013-11-17)) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes and for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. *West Gervais Historic Commercial District/National Register District/City Center*
5. **726 King Street** (TMS#11316-14-01) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes and preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. *Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area*
MOVED FROM REGULAR AGENDA-HISTORIC

Staff finds that the project complies with Sec. 17-698 of the City Ordinance and recommends preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill with the following conditions:

- the project meeting or exceeding the 20% investment threshold requirements for qualified rehabilitation expenses
- All work meeting the standards for work as outlined in Section 17-698
- All details deferred to staff

Staff finds that the project complies with Sec. 17-698 of the City Ordinance and recommends a Certificate of Design Approval, with all details deferred to staff.

6. **2610-12 Lee Street** (TMS#11316-14-01) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes and preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. *Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area*
MOVED FROM REGULAR AGENDA-HISTORIC

Staff finds that the project complies with Sec. 17-698 of the City Ordinance and recommends preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill with the following conditions:

- the project meeting or exceeding the 20% investment threshold requirements for qualified rehabilitation expenses
- All work meeting the standards for work as outlined in Section 17-698
- All details deferred to staff

Motion by Ms. Grate to accept the Consent Agenda as recommended by staff. Motion seconded by Mr. Powell. Consent Agenda approved 6-0.

**III. REGULAR AGENDA
URBAN DESIGN
HISTORIC**

4. **Southeast corner of Gervais and Lincoln Streets** (adjacent to 902 Gervais Street) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction for a Visitor’s Center. *West Gervais Historic Commercial District/City Center Design/Development District*

Amy Moore, preservation planner, presented the request. The proposal is to move the Columbia Visitor’s Center into a small contemporary building under the train depot which runs along Senate Street. David Sickinger, Garvin Design Group, spoke on the design of the building, landscaping and materials being used.

Bill Ellen, President and CEO of Midlands Authority For Conventions, Sports & Tourism, spoke on the need of the project as Columbia has become a destination area for travel and people to visit.

Motion by Mr. Hyler to approve the request for Certificate of Design Approval for the Southeast corner of Gervais and Lincoln Streets for the construction of the new visitors’ center with the conditions that the glass cube not be allowed to go dark during the tourism/restaurant dining hours at night, with those details deferred to staff; as well as all other details for signage and finishes.

Motion seconded by Mr. Cohn. Motion passes 6-0.

5. 726 King Street (TMS#11316-14-01) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes and preliminary certi **MOVED TO CONSENT AGENDA** *Lower Waverly Protection Area*

6. 2610-12 Lee Street (TMS#11316-14-01) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes and preliminary certi **MOVED TO CONSENT AGENDA** *Lower Waverly Protection Area*

7. **2130 Senate Street** (TMS#11406-11-10) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for changes to approved plans on new construction. *Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area*

Staci Richey, preservation planner, presented the request.

This is a single family home built in 2016. During construction the applicant changed the design of the material in the front porch gable to board and batten.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the proposal does not meet Section 4 of the guidelines and **recommends denial**, and deferral of details to staff to work out a siding or “shake” product for the porch gable to match historic buildings on the street.

The applicant was not in attendance for the request.

As no one spoke in favor or opposition of the request, testimony was closed for Board discussion.

Motion by Mr. Powell that the constructed design be denied in its design based on staff recommendations. Either a shake product or a siding product that is reflective of the block or street be installed as prior approved by the D/DRC.

Motion seconded by Ms. Grate. Motion passes 6-0.

8. **2207 College Street** (TMS#11409-02-21) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction. *Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area*

Staci Richey, preservation planner, presented the request.

This is a request for approval of an alteration to the design of the left side of a new single-family home that was approved with conditions by the D/DRC at their September 2016 meeting. The current proposal is for small windows in the bay near the front, on both floors, instead of full size windows as approved. This leaves only a single full size window on the entire left elevation, with four small windows.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff supports the previous motion of the DDRC for full size windows in the left elevation. Staff also finds that the proposal for small windows does not comply with Section 4-A: Guidelines for New Construction and **recommends denial.**

David Barry, owner and builder of the property, spoke on his request.

As no one spoke in favor or opposition of the request, testimony was closed for Board discussion.

Motion by Mr. Powell in regard to 2207 College Street as presented in the documentation provided to the Commission, with the two windows on the left-hand side forward both upstairs and downstairs in the elevation, that that elevation in particular be denied with the instruction or guidance that if those windows were substituted for windows matching on the downstairs 2'6" x5'6" windows which matches the opposite side elevation in roughly the same position and on the second floor 2'6"x5' which matches the other larger window on the second floor, that that massing would be deemed acceptable by this board and be in keeping with the guidelines.

Motion seconded by Mr. Hyler. Motion passes 6-0.

9. **3230 Devereaux Road** (TMS#13901-10-08) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior change and addition. *Melrose Heights/Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District*

Staci Richey, preservation planner, presented the request.

This is a c.1947 single-family, brick veneer, Minimal Traditional style home that contributes to the Melrose Heights/Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District. Staff received information that the porch was being enclosed without approval and without a permit and contacted the new owner to inform them about the historic district. The applicant is applying to enclose the side porch and build a rear addition.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the proposal meets Sections 5, 6 and 7 of the guidelines and **recommends a Certificate of Design Approval with the following conditions:**

- That the **eaves of the addition use wood or cement fiberboard rather than vinyl**
- That the **addition receives an additional window opening in the east wall**
- That the **porch enclosure gain additional glazing in the front and rear wall to match the pattern of the east wall and maximize the transparency of the enclosure and remove any proposed walls**
- All details be deferred to staff

Chuck Hartley, property owner, presented on the request. Mr. Hartley stated they are more than willing to comply with all staff recommendations and comply with all guidelines.

As no one spoke in favor or opposition of the request, testimony was closed for Board discussion.

Motion by Ms. Grate to grant Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes on an addition at 3230 Devereaux Road in the Melrose Heights/Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District based upon the following conditions:

- **That the eaves of the addition use wood or cement fiberboard rather than vinyl**
- **That the addition receives an additional window opening in the east wall**
- **That the porch enclosure gain additional glazing in the front and rear wall and that these items match the pattern of the east wall to maximize the transparency of the enclosure**
- **and any other details to be deferred to staff**

Motion seconded by Mr. Powell. Motion passes 6-0.

10. **1311 Summerville Avenue** (TMS#09113-02-04) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes, addition. *Cottontown Architectural Conservation District*

Recusal from discussion or vote by Mr. Bouknight.

Amy Moore, preservation planner, presented the request.

This is a contributing two-story Foursquare, featuring a full front porch, low-pitched hip roof, a large central dormer, and exposed rafter tails in the eaves. An addition at the rear of the home was added at some point; only details from the first floor are visible from the public right-of-way. The owners would like to construct a more substantial addition there.

The owners would like to keep the small transom windows on the second floor of the proposed addition, which do not meet the guidelines, rather than full-sized windows.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that assessing the scale and massing of the proposed addition is difficult since the exterior dimensions point to it being 13' in length but interior dimensioning indicates differently.

Given that the addition appears equal or very close to the length of the original four square massing, staff **recommends that a hyphen be provided to clearly indicate the massing of the original structure.** This technique has been recommended by the DDRC on similar projects and successfully provides clarity with regard to massing. More definitive information is needed before making that decision. There are a few options—the case could be deferred until the following month or if the DDRC and the applicant are comfortable with staff working with the applicant on a hyphen (if staff

judges it is needed after clarification of information), then the DDRC could defer the case and all its details to staff.

Staff recommends for denial of the transom windows as they do not meet Section V of the Guidelines for New Construction nor Section VI, Guidelines for Additions/Enclosures to Existing Buildings.

Joannie & Mike Nickel, homeowners, presented their request.

As no one spoke in favor or opposition of the request, testimony was closed for Board discussion.

Motion by Mr. Hyler to approve the Certificate of Design Approval for 1311 Summerville Avenue as presented to allow for transom windows and not to include a hyphen to not disturb any historic foundation based on the location and limited visibility.

Motion seconded by Mr. Cohn. Motion passes 4-1 with Mr. Powell in opposition.

11. 1621 Main Street and 1625 Main Street (TMS#09014-10-11 and -12) Request site plan approval for the construction of 6 residential units. **DEFERRED** *National Register District/City Center/Design Development District*
12. 1621 Main Street (TMS#09014-10-12) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes and for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. **DEFERRED** *National Register District/City Center/Design Development District*
13. 1625 Main Street (TMS#09014-10-11) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes and for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. **DEFERRED** *National Register District/City Center Design/Development District*

Mr. Bouknight reseeded at the Commission.

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

933 Main Street

Lucinda Statler, urban design planner, presented on this proposal is for a new residential apartment building over parking on the parcel with the former Nickelodeon Theater and Immaculate Consumption. The existing building will remain. The project came before the Commission in August and was denied. The applicant has made changes based on the comments by Commissioners and is presenting to get feedback prior to submitting a formal application.

Ford Elliott, developer for the project, presented on the request.

Wes Bolick, architect for the project, spoke on the design.

The Commission made some suggestions, based on the staff comments.

Ms. Moore introduced the new preservation planner, Rachel Walling. Ms. Walling has a degree in architecture and historic preservation.

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

September minutes

Motion by Mr. Powell to approve the September 8, 2016 minutes. *Motion seconded by Mr. Hyler.*
Motion approved 6-0.

VI. ADJOURN

There being no further business, motion to adjourn by Mr. Hyler, seconded by Mr. Powell.
Meeting adjourned at 6:03PM.



Chairperson

10 November 2016
Date

Respectfully submitted
Planning and Development Services Department