CITY OF COLUMBIA
DESIGN / DEVELOPMENT REVIEW COMMISSION
November 10, 2016
Regular Session – 4:00 PM
Minutes
City Hall
2nd Floor, Mayor's Conference Room • 1737 Main Street • Columbia, SC

Members Present: Paul Bouknight, Harris Cohn, LaToya Grate, Ashby Gressette, Bowen Horger, Ryan Hyler (arrived during discussion of 1634 Main Street), John Powell, Tom Savory, Robert Wynn
Members Absent: None
Staff: Amy Moore, Lucinda Statler, Staci Richey, Rachel Walling, Doreen Roy, John Fellows, Johnathan Chambers, Shane Shaughnessy, Andrea Wolfe

I. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Robert Wynn at 4:00 PM.

Ms. Moore noted changes to the agenda since publication.

II. CONSENT AGENDA
URBAN
HISTORIC

1. **1121 Daly Street** (TMS#13901-12-05) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for porch enclosure. *Melrose Heights/Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District, Bailey Bill*

Staff Recommendations:
Staff recommends a Certificate of Design Approval as the proposal meets the Bailey Bill ordinance and Section 7 of the guidelines, with all details deferred to staff.

2. **1621 Main Street and 1625 Main Street** (TMS# 09014-10-11 and -12) Request site plan approval for the construction of 6 residential units. *National Register District/City Center/Design Development District*

Staff Recommendations:
Recommend approval with conditions (see list in evaluation)

3. **1621 Main Street** (TMS# 09014-10-12) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes and for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. *National Register District/City Center/Design Development District*

Staff Recommendations:
Staff recommends granting a Certificate of Design Approval and preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill for 1621 Main Street based on its conformance with Sec. 17-698(d) of the City Ordinance with the following conditions:

- Staff to work with applicant on the design of all façade details including but not limited to the window hoods and trim, the cornice design, and the storefront configuration;
- Cleaning and repairs to the brick, mortar, and tin ceiling to be reviewed by staff;
- The window materials and profiles to be reviewed by staff prior to purchase;
- The project shall meet or exceed the 20% investment threshold requirement for qualified rehabilitation expenses;
- All work shall meet the standards for work as outlined in Section 17-698;

- All details deferred to staff.

4. **1625 Main Street** (TMS# 09014-10-11) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes and for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. *National Register District/City Center Design/Development District*

Staff Recommendations:

Staff recommends granting a Certificate of Design Approval and preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill for 1625 Main Street based on its conformance with Sec. 17-698(d) of the City Ordinance with the following conditions:

- Staff to work with applicant on the design of all façade details, including but not limited to the balcony, cornice, window trim and proportions, and the storefront configuration and setback;
- The window materials and profiles to be reviewed by staff prior to purchase;
- Cleaning and repairs to the brick and mortar to be reviewed by staff;
- The project shall meet or exceed the 20% investment threshold requirement for qualified rehabilitation expenses;
- All work shall meet the standards for work as outlined in Section 17-698;
- All details deferred to staff.

5. **1504-1508 Main Street** (TMS# 09014-09-17, 18) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes and for preliminary certification of the Bailey Bill. *Individual Landmark*

Staff Recommendations:

Staff recommends a Certificate of Design Approval for the project as proposed based on its conformance with Sec. 17-674(d) of the City Ordinance, with the following conditions:

- The replacement terracotta corner piece reviewed by staff prior to installation;
- The mortar and terracotta patching/replacement reviewed by staff;
- Any proposed cleaning of terracotta, brick, or mortar reviewed by staff;
- All details deferred to staff.

Staff finds that the project complies with Sec. 17-698(a) of the City Ordinance and recommends that 1508 Main Street be given preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill with the following conditions:

- The project shall meet all staff recommendations for Certificate of Design Approval as listed above;
- The project shall meet or exceed the 20% investment threshold requirement for qualified rehabilitation expenses;
- All work shall meet the standards for work as outlined in Section 17-698;
- All details deferred to staff.

6. **1923-1925 Pickens Street** (TMS# 11404-01-05) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes and for preliminary certification of the Bailey Bill. *Landmark District*

Staff Recommendations:

Staff recommends granting a Certificate of Design Approval for the project as proposed based on its conformance with Sec. 17-674(d) of the City Ordinance with all details deferred to staff. Staff finds that the project complies with Sec. 17-698(a) of the City Ordinance and recommends that 1923-1925 Pickens Street be given preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill with the following conditions:

- The project shall meet or exceed the 20% investment threshold requirement for qualified rehabilitation expenses;
- All work shall meet the standards for work as outlined in Section 17-698;
- All details deferred to staff.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

October minutes

Motion by Mr. Gressette to accept the Consent Agenda based on the recommendations of staff. ***Motion seconded by Mr. Powell.*** **Consent Agenda approved 8-0.**

III. REGULAR AGENDA

DESIGN

1. **1701 Main Street** (TMS# 09014-02-05) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for site improvements at the Richland County Courthouse. *City Center Design/Development District.* **WITHDRAWN**
2. **933 Main Street** (TMS# 08916-06-03) Request for site plan approval for new construction. *City Center Design/Development District* **DEFERRED**
3. **933 Main Street** (TMS# 08916-06-03) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction. *City Center Design/Development District* **DEFERRED**

HISTORIC

1. **1634 Main Street** (TMS#09014-04-19) Request for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill and Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes. *Individual Landmark/City Center/Design Development District*

Staci Richey, preservation planner, presented the request for a c.1870s building that has had a number of façade changes over the years, the latest of which was the removal of stucco from the 1980s to reveal the 1937 upper story.

The current proposal is to restore the second floor of the façade, open windows along the private alleyway along the south elevation, and to alter the exterior elevation which is visible from Sumter Street. The request at this time is to return the façade to the 1940s appearance.

A separate motion will be required for recommendation of preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill, and one for Certificate of Design Approval.

Staff Recommendations:
Staff finds that the project generally complies with Sec. 17-698 of the City Ordinance and recommends preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill with the following conditions:

- The storefront and rear wall details be submitted for review by staff and that staff may return this project to DDRC for further review if necessary when those details are available.
- The project meeting or exceeding the 20% investment threshold requirements for qualified rehabilitation expenses.
- All work meeting the standards for work as outlined in Section 17-698.
- All details deferred to staff.

Staff recommends a Certificate of Design Approval for the project as proposed based on its conformance with Sec. 17-674(d) of the City Ordinance with the following conditions:

- The storefront and rear wall details be submitted for review by staff and that staff may return this project to DDRC for further review if necessary when those details are available.
- All details deferred to staff.

Freeman Belser and Ben Rexx of Belser Five, LLC, applicants for the request, agreed to comply with staff recommendations.

Martha Fowler, local business owner, spoke in support of the requests.
[Mr. Hyler arrived – 4:15 PM]

Matt Kennell, City Center Partnership, voiced support of the request.

Andy Chandler, retiree of the State Historic Preservation Office, voiced support of the request.

As no one else spoke in favor or opposition of the request, testimony closed.

Motion by Mr. Powell to recommend 1634 Main Street for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill subject to staff conditions.

Motion seconded by Ms. Grate. **Motion approved 9-0.**

Motion by Mr. Gressette to grant a Certificate of Design Approval for 1634 Main Street based on the recommendations of staff as listed, and also upon further review of staff for the proposed design.

Motion seconded by Mr. Horger. **Motion approved 9-0.**

2. 1420 Hagood Avenue (TMS#13902-01-18) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for changes to design for new construction for single family home, appeal of staff decision for driveway. *Melrose Heights/Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District* ***Deferral of driveway item only***

Recusal by Mr. Savory from this item for discussion and vote.

Staci Richey, preservation planner, presented the request for a lot to be subdivided from an existing house for the construction of a new two-story building that was approved by D/DRC two months ago with a number of conditions.

One of the conditions for approval was:
That the proposed vinyl windows either be replaced with a window consistent with the guidelines or that they be concealed entirely by an exterior window that meets the guidelines, as determined by staff.

Staff Recommendations:
Staff finds that the proposal does not meet Section 5 of the guidelines and recommends **denial**.

John McLean, homeowner, presented on his request.

Betsy Kaemmerlen, neighborhood resident, spoke in favor of the proposal.

Pam Hopkins, neighborhood resident, spoke in support of historic designation and supported the guidelines and voiced opposition to the request.

Martha Fowler, neighborhood resident, voiced opposition to the request.

Mr. McLean provided rebuttal to comments made by neighbors and staff.

As no one else spoke in favor or opposition of the request, testimony closed for board discussion.

Mr. Wynn reviewed the criteria of the guidelines for the area.

Board discussed the item.

Ms. Richey asked that the D/DRC maintain their original motion and deny the current proposal.

Based on the principles of Section 5 of the Melrose Heights / Oak Lawn District, Motion by Mr. Gressette to accept and approve the drawings as re-submitted by the applicant for 1420 Hagood Avenue based on board interpretations on the intent of the guidelines.

Motion seconded by Mr. Hyler. **Motion passes 5-3 with Mr. Bouknight, Ms. Grate and Mr. Wynn in opposition of the motion.**

3. 2138 Senate Street (TMS#11406-11-10) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for changes to approved plans on new construction. *Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area*

WITHDRAWN

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

SCANA site mixed-use informational presentation

Lucinda Statler, urban design planner, introduced the conceptual presentation for a mixed-use development to include 30,000SF grocery store with 177 residential units above, 10,000SF of amenity and leasing space, a free-standing retail space of 12,500SF, and a combination of structured and surface parking.

The project is currently in the process of rezoning from M-2, -DD to C-3, -DD. Staff have met with the applicants a number of times, and have provided feedback relative to the City Center Design/ Development Guidelines. This site has a number of challenges, including a large (72") sub-surface storm drain easement, a sanitary sewer line easement, and a number of wide overhead power line easements that connect to the adjacent substation. Given these limitations that prevent it from meeting a number of the site planning guidelines, it is imperative that the guidelines which can be met do not fall short.

A full evaluation will be written when the project comes for a formal approval. At this time, select guidelines and comments addressing outstanding issues have been provided in the evaluation sheet.

Chris Kacena of Studio Archtiects presented and answered questions about the project. Mark Senn, developer, then made some comments and said they will present formally at the December meeting.

VI. ADJOURN

There being no further business, motion to adjourn by Mr. Hyler, seconded by Ms. Grate. Meeting adjourned at 6:05PM.

Robert H. Wynn Jr.
Chairperson

8 December 2016
Date

Respectfully submitted
Planning and Development Services Department