
CITY OF COLUMBIA
DESIGN / DEVELOPMENT REVIEW COMMISSION

July 14, 2016

Regular Session – 4:00 PM

Minutes

City Hall

Council Chambers • 1737 Main Street • Columbia, SC

Members Present: Paul Bouknight, Harris Cohn, LaToya Grate, Ashby Gressette, John Powell, Tom Savory, Robert Wynn

Members Absent: Bowen Horger, Ryan Hyler

Staff: Amy Moore, Lucinda Statler, Staci Richey, Leigh DeForth, John Fellows, Johnathan Chambers, Brian Cook, Andrea Wolfe

I. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Robert Wynn at 4:00 PM.

Ms. Moore noted changes to the agenda since publication.

II. CONSENT AGENDA

URBAN DESIGN

HISTORIC

1. **929 Gervais Street** (TMS# 09013-11-10) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes. *W. Gervais Historic Commercial District/Bailey Bill project*
2. **1608 Main Street** (TMS# 09014-04-14) Request for a Certificate of Site Plan Review. *Individual Landmark*
3. **1328 Richland Street** (TMS# 09015-09-07) Request for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. *Landmark District/City Center Design/Development District*
4. **1015 King Street** (TMS#11413-01-07) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction. *Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area*

Motion by Mr. Gressette to approve the Consent Agenda based on the recommendation of staff. Motion seconded by Mr. Powell. Consent Agenda approved 7-0.

III. REGULAR AGENDA

URBAN DESIGN

1. **2025 Main Street (TMS# 09015-02-03) Appeal to staff decision to deny installation of solar panels on roof City Center Design/Development District**

Mr. Wynn recused himself from discussion or vote on this case turning the chair position over to Mr. Gressette.

Lucinda Statler, urban design planner, spoke on the request whereas the applicant received a grant to install solar panels on the roof of this building. The grant application process was completed and awarded prior to permitting. As this property is in an urban design overlay district, it requires design review. The City Center Design/Development Guidelines do not have specific guidelines for solar panels; however they do require that any changes to the exterior of the building that are visible from the public right-of-way receive a Certificate of Design Approval prior to permitting.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

To this end, staff recommends approving the Certificate of Design Approval with the condition that the panels be mounted on the flat roofed portion of the building to the west of the standing seam roof, OR, to mount the panels at the far southern end of the standing seam roof, stacked vertically- rather than horizontally- in order to minimize their visibility from Elmwood Avenue.

Craig Currey, Executive Direction of Transitions, presented the request. Mr. Currey stated the installation of solar panels would allow for a reduction in cost of utilities which would then allow Transitions to provide services to a larger number of clients.

As no one spoke in favor or opposition of the request, testimony closed for board deliberation.

Mr. Currey voiced no opposition to staff recommendation if required for approval of the request.

Motion by Mr. Savory to recommend approval of installation of the solar panels with the condition that they be mounted preferably on the flat roof, or at a location on the pitched roof further south if that is not possible; to be worked out with staff.

Motion seconded by Mr. Powell. Motion for passes 6-0.

Chair position returned to Mr. Wynn.

- 2. 1400 Lady Street** (TMS# 11401-04-01) Request for CDA for exterior changes to existing building *City Center Design/ Development District*

Mr. Powell recused himself from discussion and vote on this case.

Lucinda Statler, urban design planner, spoke on the request which came before the Commission in March of this year, to request a change to the front façade, 2nd and 3rd floor window pattern. That request was denied and two design alternatives proposed. For the purposes of this evaluation, they will be referred to as Options A and B, with A being the all-glass atrium and Option B the glass and translucent wall system.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

Staff recommends denial of the request based on Section 5.9.4 Window replacement, as the removal of the original window openings does not meet this guideline, and 5.9 Building Additions, Renovations, and Demolitions, as the addition does not meet this guideline.

Chuck Hultstrand of LS3P Associates, architects for the project, presented on both proposed options.

Ken Wingate, chairman of the governing body “The Session” of the First Presbyterian Church, spoke on the request.

Fifteen to twenty congregation members were in attendance in support of the project.

As no one else spoke in favor or opposition of the request, testimony closed for board deliberation.

Motion by Mr. Gressette to grant a Certificate of Design Approval of the conceptual design as presented on this project at 1400 Lady Street. *Motion seconded by Mr. Cohn.*

Motion is tied with a 3-3 vote with Mr. Gressette, Mr. Cohn and Mr. Wynn in approval of the motion; and Mr. Bouknight, Ms. Grate and Mr. Savory opposed to the motion.

Board discussion regarding Scheme A versus Scheme B.

Motion by Mr. Gressette to accept the design as presented conceptually by the applicant with the caveat that certain elements are preserved as suggested by Mr. Savory.

Motion clarified by Mr. Savory stating that the elements removed from the original façade be preserved and protected in perpetuity, and be kept in such a way that they can be reinstalled on the existing building.

Both Mr. Savory and Mr. Gressette stated approval pertained to Scheme B.

Motion seconded by Mr. Cohn. Motion approved 5-1 with Ms. Grate in opposition of approval.

- 3. 1401-1431 Assembly Street and 1011-1019 Washington Street (TMS # 09013-03-01, 06, 07, 08, 09, 10, 11, 12, 13) Request for Site Plan Approval for new construction. *City Center Design/ Development District***

Johnathan Chambers, land development administrator, presented on this project which entails the construction of a 355,000 sq. ft., 15-story, 305-unit multi-family building on approximately one acre. The required number of parking spaces for this development is 593 whereas the applicant proposes to provide 151 within the parking garage and 183 on-street. On Tuesday, July 12th, the Board of Zoning Appeals granted a variance for the remaining 259 parking spaces that would be required. Though there are many staff comments within this case summary, the proposed site plan largely meets the requirements. A traffic impact study was completed, which the City traffic engineer reviewed and approved. An additional condition requested by planning staff is information on an additional traffic impact study regarding pedestrian and bicycle traffic be provided to staff prior to the issuance of any permits to ensure the increased bicycle and pedestrian traffic be accommodated. Should the Commission be inclined to grant approval of the site plan, staff requests that the Commission grant approval subject staff comments.

Robert Neely, architect for the project, presented on the request.

Robin Waites, Executive Director with Historic Columbia, provided a history of the current building discouraging its demolition based on the guidelines and the relocation of the structure.

Lydia Brant, architectural history professor at USC, spoke in opposition and requested denial of the proposal.

Martha Fowler, property owner of several historic buildings on Main Street, spoke in opposition of the request.

Jeannette Stroy, daughter of Joseph Stroy the former business owner at 1401 Assembly Street, spoke on the history of the familial business in the building and black history in the area. Ms. Stroy voiced support for the existing building to remain as part of the project.

Matt Kennell, City Center Partnership, spoke in support of site plan approval and relocation of the building.

Jay Case, principal with Clayco, said on-going discussions have been held regarding the relocation of the building however Clayco is not fully in control of the relocation process for the building.

Mr. Chambers requested a brief recess for staff to confer.

Motion by Mr. Cohn for a brief recess to be taken at 5:10PM.

Motion seconded by Mr. Powell. Motion approved 7-0.

Motion by Mr. Gressette to reconvene the meeting at 5:30PM.

Motion seconded by Mr. Powell. Motion approved 7-0.

As no one else spoke in favor or opposition of the request, testimony closed for board deliberation.

Mr. Wynn provided a synopsis of the meeting procedures up to this point, requesting Board discussion or a motion.

Based upon staff recommendations and items within the D/DRC purview, motion by Ms. Grate to recommend approval for site plan approval for new construction for 1401-1431 Assembly Street and 1011-1019 Washington Street subject to staff comments.

Motion seconded by Mr. Powell. Motion approved 6-1 with Mr. Bouknight in opposition.

4. **1401-1431 Assembly Street and 1011-1019 Washington Street** (TMS # 09013-03-01, 06, 07, 08, 09, 10, 11, 12, 13) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction.
City Center Design/Development District

Lucinda Statler, urban design planner, presented on the proposal, at the northwest corner of Assembly and Washington, for the development of a 15-story multi-family building with structured parking. The proposal includes moving the existing building one block to the west.

The applicant came before this Commission in May 2016 with an informational presentation to gather feedback. Many of the recommendations are consistent with the comments that were provided at that time.

Robert Neely, architect for the project, presented on the request. Mr. Neely addressed design decisions with regard to staff comments.

Steve Hinson, Vista resident, spoke in opposition to the request.

Matt Kennell, City Center Partnership, spoke in favor of the request.

Reginald Randolph, Sr., worked in the barbershop previously, and voiced opposition to the proposal as is saying he would like to have the original building remain as part of the proposed project.

Anthony Fike, Columbia resident, spoke in support of the project.

As no one else spoke in favor or opposition of the request, testimony closed for board deliberation.

Many Board members felt this is an exciting project, however the base/articulation/texture of the tower are under D/DRC purview and have not been satisfied. It is felt staff recommendations are fairly major and have not yet been fully addressed to their satisfaction.

Motion by Mr. Wynn to defer the request to a work session with the applicants to address significant concerns of design that exist at this time, and to work further with staff.

Motion seconded by Mr. Gressette. Motion approved 7-0.

HISTORIC

- 5. 601-603 Saluda Avenue (TMS# 11308-11-13) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for demolition. *Wales Garden Architectural Conservation District***

Recusal by Mr. Savory from discussion and vote as this is his neighborhood.

Amy Moore, historic preservation planner, presented the request from the City of Columbia for the demolition of a duplex building, based upon its structural condition combined with its impact on the accessibility needed for a storm water project. The City commissioned an engineering study on the structural integrity of the duplex, which demonstrated significant compromises in the building's structure; given the conclusions from the study, the City requested the building's demolition in order to use the property for access and a staging area for the considerable amount of work which needs to be done.

Staff Recommendations:

Staff finds that that the structural issues for this building are significant, as evidenced by the structural report and recommendations, that the building is not one of the last of its kind on the block, area, or City, that while the building itself is not presently presenting a severe life/ safety hazard, the conditions behind the duplexes could indeed affect public safety if not addressed, and recommends for demolition according to Section 17-674 of the City of Columbia Ordinance.

Dana Higgins, City of Columbia utilities and engineering, spoke on the erosion issues.

Jimmy Chao, Chao and Associates, spoke on structural issues.

As no one spoke in favor or opposition of the request, testimony closed for board deliberation.

Motion by Mr. Gressette to grant the request for demolition to the property at 601-603 Saluda Avenue based on the recommendation of staff, and based on the observation that this may be a public health and safety issue. The loss of the one apartment does not ruin the neighborhood.

Motion seconded by Ms. Grate. Motion passes 5-1 with Mr. Powell in opposition.

Ms. Moore noted that any new proposed structure on this property will require review by the D/DRC.

- 6. 1317 Geiger Street** (TMS#09110-11-07) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes. *Cottontown Architectural Conservation District*

Amy Moore, historic preservation planner, presented on the request for a c. 1925 Bungalow style single-family home that is contributing to the Cottontown Architectural Conservation District. The building features a prominent side gable roof that engages to cover the full-width front porch with a small dormer is located centrally.

The proposal is to remove the front dormer, “scoop” out the roof, and construct a larger dormer in its place for a second story bedroom/bath on the bungalow

Staff Recommendations:

Staff finds that the proposal does not meet Sections 5, 6 and 7 of the guidelines and recommends that the request for Certificate of Design Approval be denied.

Jeff Lewis, architect for the project, presented on behalf of Jeff Sessions, homeowner.

As no one spoke in favor or opposition of the request, testimony closed for board deliberation.

Motion by Mr. Gressette to approve the design as presented at 1317 Geiger Street.

No one seconded the motion, therefore the motion failed.

Motion by Mr. Wynn to deny the application at 1317 Geiger Street based on Sections 5, 6 and 7 of the guidelines.

Motion seconded by Ms. Grate.

Mr. Savory stated this was not a referendum as a negative vote on the design. If this ends as a vote of denial, he feels it has more to do with the D/DRC’s charge to ensure that the street facades of these buildings remain as they were historically because the neighborhood depends upon that as a result of having voted to make their neighborhood a conservation district.

Motion for denial passes 4-3 with Mr. Bouknight, Mr. Gressette, and Mr. Cohn opposed to denial of the request.

WITHDRAWN 7. **3101 Lindsay Street** (TMS#09105-18-10) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for addition, exterior changes. *Earlewood Protection Area*

MOVED/CONSENT 8. **1015 King Street** (TMS#11413-01-07) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction. *Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area*

DEFERRED 9. **1634 Main Street** (TMS# 09014-04-19) Request for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. *Individual Landmark/City Center/Design Development District*

10. West Gervais Historic Commercial District and West Gervais Historic Protection Area District— request for a recommendation for approval to City Council for the plan and updated guidelines.

Ms. Moore provided an overview of the process to develop the guidelines. A few years ago the City was asked to update the guidelines for the West Gervais Commercial District and Protection Area. The result is a document that has been updated with consistent language and photographs that reinforce the principles that have always been a part of the guidelines for this area. Since the City Center Design/Development District underlies both these districts, those guidelines as well as the ones for the West Gervais Commercial District and Protection Area have been combined into one document.

The guidelines are being presented to the DDRC as a request for a recommendation for approval by City Council. If in favor, then a motion would be for a positive recommendation to Council.

Mr. Fellows presented an overview of the plan document which supports the guidelines.

Ms. Richey presented on the guidelines.

Mary Langston, Vista resident and member of the Vista Neighborhood Association, said with redevelopment, it must be taken into consideration what neighborhoods want and that all guidelines should be adhered to.

Motion by Ms. Grate to recommend for approval to City Council the West Gervais Historic Commercial District and West Gervais Historic Protection Area District plan and updated guidelines.

Motion seconded by Mr. Savory. Motion approved 7-0.

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

June Minutes

Motion by Ms. Grate to approve the June 9, 2016 minutes. *Motion seconded by Mr. Powell. Motion approved 7-0.*

VI. ADJOURN

There being no further business, motion to adjourn by Mr. Powell at 7:12PM

Chairperson

Date

Respectfully submitted
Planning and Development Services Department