



CITY OF COLUMBIA
WORK SESSION MINUTES
TUESDAY, JULY 15, 2014
CITY HALL – 1737 MAIN STREET
2nd FLOOR CONFERENCE ROOM

The Columbia City Council conducted a Work Session on Tuesday, July 15, 2014 at City Hall, 1737 Main Street, Columbia, South Carolina. The Honorable Mayor Stephen K. Benjamin called the meeting to order at 10:24 a.m. and the following members of Council were present: The Honorable Sam Davis, The Honorable Tameika Isaac Devine and The Honorable Cameron A. Runyan. The Honorable Moe Baddourah arrived at 11:15 a.m. The Honorable Leona K. Plough and The Honorable Brian DeQuincey Newman were absent. Also present were Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager and Ms. Erika D. Moore, City Clerk. This meeting was advertised in accordance with the Freedom of Information Act.

1. [City Manager's Report](#) – Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager presented the new organizational chart. She highlighted the following elements that she believes will prove beneficial to us as a city: the Division of Customer Care is being placed with our Finance Department, because they deal with a lot of our water issues and all customer care related issues in the City and the Code Enforcement Division is being moved to the Columbia Police Department, but will still involve the Fire Department for inspections. She said this will make it easier for citizens to contact one area and Mr. Baker is taking a lead on the transitions with these areas. She reported that Chief Holbrook has a briefing for Council on the implementation of security cameras.

2. [May Financial Report](#) – Ms. Jan Alonso, Finance Director

Ms. Jan Alonso, Finance Director presented the financial report for May 30, 2014. She noted that the encumbrances have been included for each fund. She stated that there is a negative in the revenues for the General Fund, but we will meet all of our revenue projections for the year.

Mayor Benjamin asked when we will have the end of fiscal year numbers.

Mr. Jeff Palen, Assistant City Manager for Finance and Economic Services / Chief Financial Officer said no later than October.

Ms. Jan Alonso, Finance Director continued to report that Parking Fund revenues are down due to the loss of one hundred eighty (180) meters during construction on Assembly Street.

Councilor Davis asked if the meters will go back.

Ms. Melissa Gentry, P.E., Assistant City Manager for Operations clarified that not all of the one hundred eighty (180) meters were on Assembly Street, but those meters will be mitigated.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager recalled that as part of our business friendly practices, meters were removed near Washington Square and on Main Street.

Ms. Jan Alonso, Finance Director said most of the encumbrances in the Water and Sewer Fund are for maintenance projects. She said that nothing has changed in the report for Columbia Common. She noted that the next financial update will be provided in September and hard numbers will be provided in October.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Upon a motion made by Mr. Runyan and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to enter into Executive Session at 10:35 a.m. for the discussion of **Item 3** and **4** as outlined.

- **Mr. Baddourah joined the meeting at 11:15 a.m.**
- 3. Receipt of legal advice which relates to a matter covered by attorney-client privilege – *This item was discussed in Executive Session. No action was taken.*
- 4. Discussion of negotiations incident to proposed contractual arrangement – *This item was discussed in Executive Session. No action was taken.*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Davis and seconded by Mr. Runyan, Council voted unanimously to adjourn the Executive Session at 12:28 p.m. Mr. Baddourah was not present for the vote.

CITY COUNCIL DISCUSSION / ACTION

- 5. [Water and Wastewater Update and Information](#) – Ms. Melissa Gentry P.E., Assistant City Manager for Operations and Mr. Joey Jaco, Director of the Utilities and Engineering Department

Ms. Melissa Gentry P.E., Assistant City Manager for Operations explained that this presentation will cover the status of the Consent Decree with regard to deliverables due to the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA). She noted that the dates being provided reflect when the reports are due, not when it will be completed. She further explained that the presentation will cover major activities that have been underway for fiscal year 2013/2014; a summary of the Capital Improvement Program; proposed and actual projects by type; and significant accomplishments related to projects and staffing resources. She said we will also discuss the fiscal year 2014/2015 Capital Improvement Program; an improved tracking system; and the impact of the reduction from our original proposal to the \$40 million and future projects. She noted that they are not asking for a

lot of new staff; they are working harder and smarter and recognizing efficiencies when possible. She said we will discuss future goals and initiatives to include public/private partnerships and public awareness.

Mr. Gerry Benson, Clean Water 2020 Program Manager / CDM Smith, Inc. explained that the consent decree was entered into federal court on May 21, 2014 as a binding agreement between the City of Columbia, the EPA and the Department of Justice. He outlined the deliverables under the Consent Decree, noting that a sewer mapping program must be submitted next week. He said that a Financial Management Plan will be submitted in November 2015 and it will describe how we are going to fund the entire program over the next twelve (12) years to include the sources of funds, the impact of the costs and forecasts on future rate increases that may or not be needed in order to fund the program. He noted that a draft of the plan will be ready in December 2014. He explained that the Supplemental Infrastructure Repair Program is a major submittal to the EPA that is due in 2020 and it will outline plans for improvements from 2020 to 2025; it is a long range planning process. He reported that substantial progress has been made with the upcoming deliverables. He noted that quarterly reports must be submitted to the EPA along with annual reports outlining what has been accomplished in the current year and what will be accomplished in the upcoming year. He stated that the reports will be available to the public and the deliverables are required to be posted to the public; deposited in the library; and made available on certain websites. He noted that many documents have a public review and comment period before being submitted to the EPA. In closing, he stated that there are penalties if the implementation dates aren't met; the EPA must approve most of the plans; we must address any issues raised; implementation costs will be prepared for all plans; and no obligations can be deferred.

Mr. Joey Jaco, Director of the Utilities and Engineering Department explained how active projects will be reported. He noted that they verify the numbers through the Finance Department and will continue to improve the reporting process going forward.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said she is excited that we are going to have a transparent look at projects. She asked if there is anything else the members of Council would like to see in the report.

Mayor Benjamin said we are paying for things we didn't do twenty (20) years ago and we are paying for what we want to see twenty (20) years from now; it is important that we look forward and that we stay the course. He said that Ms. Wilson and staff have been very diligent in making sure we spend quality time assessing our current system and making sure that everyone is paying what they should be paying. He said we will be acting on these recommendations immediately and as soon as it's done, we need to move forward with the appropriate rate increases. He said we need to be as judicious and as conservative as possible in expending these resources and making sure that there are no projects left undone; we have to measure and account for every dollar that has been spent.

Mr. Joey Jaco, Director of the Utilities and Engineering Department reported that Clean Water 2020 initiatives are underway such as CityWorks at the Metro Wastewater Treatment Plant and the Sewer Mapping Plan is ready for submission to the EPA. He said they are standardizing processes and working smarter. He reported that overtime has been reduced by 70% without cutting processes and since 2008 our Sanitary Sewer Overflows have been reduced by over 70%. He reported on the status of the following projects under the Clean Water 2020 Program: four (4) Sewer System Evaluation Studies/Rehabilitations are underway and three (3) are in the design phase; the Lake Katherine Capacity Enhancement Project; and the Metro Wastewater Treatment Plant Digester Improvement Project is under design. He mentioned that we chose to participate in the area wide optimization project with DHEC and we always rank highly. He noted that for the past five (5) years we've ranked in the top three (3) for the water taste competition. He reported that we've completed the raw water and high service pump station project at the Canal Water Treatment Plant and we now have 84 million in reliable capacity and 75 million in capacity at the Lake Murray Water Treatment Plant. He reported that three (3) projects have been completed in water; seven (7) projects are out to bid or under construction; and four (4) projects are under design in the water system. He noted that a dashboard is being developed to provide individual project and summary tracking for the Capital Improvement Program. He said we can't continue to face limitations in the Capital Improvement Program.

Ms. Dana Higgins, City Engineer reviewed the life cycle for a major project, noting that it is typically a four (4) year process. She described major projects as a water or wastewater treatment plant project or a capacity enhancement project.

Mr. Joey Jaco, Director of the Utilities and Engineering Department outlined the impacts of deferring maintenance and infrastructure improvements. He noted that reactive repairs are more costly than proactive improvements; delays result in increased emergencies; and we will continue to have Sanitary Sewer Overflows and Boil Water Advisories.

Councilor Devine asked about fines under the Consent Decree.

Mr. Gerry Benson, Clean Water 2020 Program Manager / CDM Smith, Inc. said they can start at \$500 per day.

Mr. Joey Jaco, Director of the Utilities and Engineering Department said we had planned \$100 million in projects based on the rate increase, but the CIP was reduced to \$40 million, because the rate increase wasn't approved. He outlined some of the water and wastewater projects in the Capital Improvement Program that have been deferred. He outlined the staffing and project workload approach to include a program manager.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager sought an explanation of the contract with CDM Smith for Program Management Services that City Council will be asked to approve later. She explained that it is not Mentor-Protégé work, but there are several sub-consultants working with CDM.

Mr. Joey Jaco, Director of the Utilities and Engineering Department reiterated that it is not a Mentor Protégé Program Project, but the program management team includes a number of our protégés. He said the intent is to keep that number at 25% or more of the contract. He continued to present an annual City Council approval comparison of water and wastewater contracts encumbered from fiscal year 2008/2009 through fiscal year 2018/2019. He noted that we will have high numbers in our CIP going forward; it could be up to \$750 million over the next ten (10) years. He said by reducing the CIP to \$40 million for this year, it will cause us to need more money over the next few years in order to meet deadlines in the Consent Decree.

Mr. Jeff Palen, Chief Financial Officer estimated that the cash reserve for fiscal year 2013/2014 will be \$295,358,687, which consists of \$83,782,142 in available bond balances and \$211,576,546 in cash and investments. He noted that the numbers may change. He noted the funding that has been set aside for projects that were budgeted, but haven't begun yet, leaving a cash reserve of \$137,566,615 along with \$18,673,000 in cash from the operating system that will go towards capital projects. He stated that in fiscal year 2014/2015, \$15.9 million will go towards the Water CIP; \$24.3 million will go towards the Wastewater CIP; and \$110 million will be left. He noted that they will target cash at 137% of our total operating and maintenance costs.

Councilor Runyan asked if the \$110 million is 137% of our O&M.

Mr. Jeff Palen, Chief Financial Officer said it is slightly higher; our estimate for O&M is \$107,500,000; and the number will be adjusted as we close the books.

Councilor Runyan asked if this is cash in a bank account.

Mr. Jeff Palen, Chief Financial Officer said it's a combination of bank accounts, money market and liquid investments.

Councilor Baddourah asked if we are expecting a \$13 million fund balance from the Water and Sewer Fund this year, even without the water rate increase.

Mr. Jeff Palen, Chief Financial Officer said yes.

Councilor Runyan asked if investments are marked to market; how far out are we on the curve.

Mr. Jeff Palen, Chief Financial Officer said yes, but it will have very little effect going forward. He said our policy is not to be out over seven years; and as things mature, we are rolling them into discount notes or money markets. He reiterated that the Financial Analysis Plan is due to the EPA no later than November 21, 2015, but it will be brought to City Council in December 2014 as we begin budget discussions and we need to spend a lot of time focusing on this. He noted that we are working on a RFP for a rate consultant. He said that major components of the plan will include cost analysis, a capital improvement financing program, budget and customer rate setting analysis and tracking

and reporting for operation and maintenance costs, improvement costs and the implementation schedule.

Councilor Devine asked if we are stuck with the project plan or can it be amended as the need arises.

Mr. Joey Jaco, Director of the Utilities and Engineering Department said once you submit, you commit. He said the results of the system evaluation will be used to develop the plan.

Mr. Gerry Benson, Clean Water 2020 Program Manager / CDM Smith, Inc. said we will build flexibility into the plan so that it can be adjusted based on new information.

Mr. Jeff Palen, Chief Financial Officer said we will have this discussion every year and we will review the actuals.

Mr. Joey Jaco, Director of the Utilities and Engineering Department said we continue to invest in training our employees, asset management, business processes, procurement, wastewater modeling, and the automated meter reading pilot program and implementation.

Mr. Bill Bulloch, P.E., Senior Vice President for Utility Revenue Management explained that auditing your billing system is a key portion of looking at water loss. He said they contracted with the City of Columbia in December 2013 and the mission is to assist in looking at how to maximize the billable revenue of the water and wastewater systems. He said old data and zoning changes affect your billing system and we will look at all accounts that aren't single-family residences. He acknowledged that staff has been very supportive and professional. He said they are looking at the City's large meter configuration, because they can account for a third of the revenue. He reported that they have no issues with the installation, configuration and operation of large meters. He further reported that there isn't a budget for meter maintenance and that could create systematic problems.

Councilor Devine inquired about the cost of automated meter reading; would maintenance be the same.

Mr. Bill Bulloch, P.E., Senior Vice President for Utility Revenue Management said the meter will be the same; the automated meter reading will allow you to collect more data and be more efficient on how you manage staff and the data collected; it will allow you to provide your customer with more information than they ever had before; and it will also detect leaks. He noted that you would still have to maintain the meter, but it will tell you if you have a meter malfunction. He said they will be looking at business practices and credits being issued to customers. In closing, he stated that the report will be completed by December 2014.

Councilor Davis asked if automatic meter reading has been implemented citywide.

Mr. Joey Jaco, Director of the Utilities and Engineering Department said a pilot was conducted at the prison facility off of Broad River Road and in neighborhoods adjacent to that area, which included eight hundred (800) meters. He agreed to bring a report back to Council, because this is being recommended.

Councilor Baddourah asked if it would be more beneficial to start with the businesses.

Mr. Joey Jaco, Director of the Utilities and Engineering Department said we currently use a touchpad to draw data from businesses. He continued to explain that in looking at our potential revenue and as part of the Consent Decree, we have to upgrade our Industrial Pre-Treatment Program and develop a standard satellite sewer system agreement. He said this will require us to look at rates and renegotiate with our satellite sewer customers. He noted that this will impact customers such as West Columbia, Fort Jackson and NAI America. He said this must be submitted to the EPA by May 2015. He reviewed potential areas of expansion of water services. He said that Mr. Gantt is currently working with staff, developers and those interested in getting water from the City of Columbia. He presented a map of areas for potential expansion for future development to include the Town of Chapin.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said similar to Council's annexation policy and to be aggressive looking for opportunities, it requires someone who is dedicated to that on a daily basis. She sought feedback from Council.

Mr. Joey Jaco, Director of the Utilities and Engineering Department highlighted other areas of expansion. He said that potential public/private partnerships are being sought for the handling of our biosolids through a Request for Expression of Interest (RFEI) that will be released soon.

Mr. Jeff Palen, Chief Financial Officer said many companies have approached us about handling our biosolids; we will outline our expectations over the next twelve (12) years; and ask the companies to tell us what they can do for us. He noted that this will be released by the end of August 2014 and we will make sure that what we are doing is allowable under the Consent Decree.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said that many private companies work with municipalities that are under a Consent Decree; they have approached us; and we are formally exploring this.

Mr. Joey Jaco, Director of the Utilities and Engineering Department said signage is being ordered and projects will be labeled for identification. He said that larger banners will be displayed at public meetings and in areas where large projects are underway. He noted that they are working on public interface along the way.

Mayor Benjamin said we will be working over the next several weeks; it's not about the EPA; it's about the future of Columbia; it's about economic development and jobs; we cannot waiver on that commitment and we will keep pushing until it's done.

- **Council recessed at 1:49 p.m.**
 - **Council reconvened the meeting at 2:22 p.m. and Councilor Devine was not present at this time.**
6. [Funding Requests from External Organizations](#) – Ms. Melisa Caughman, Director of the Budget & Program Management Office

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Director of the Budget & Program Management Office presented funding requests that have been received from various organizations. She reported that funding in the amount of \$75,000 in the General Fund and \$72,308 in the Accommodations Tax Fund has been identified for Council to use to fund any of these organizations.

Mayor Benjamin said we received \$10.8 million in requests for a modest pool of funds.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Director of the Budget & Program Management Office presented the projected balances for fiscal year 2014/2015 Hospitality Tax and Accommodations Tax Funds.

Councilor Davis asked about the funding recommendation for the World Affairs Council.

Mr. Ryan Coleman, Interim Director of the Office of Economic Development said they are recommending a slight reduction. He reviewed the other funding recommendations for the Economic Development budget.

Councilor Runyan requested biannual updates on deliverables.

Mr. Ryan Coleman, Interim Director of the Office of Economic Development said they are working to ensure that the deliverables coincide with the goals and objectives that were set forth in the Economic Development Strategic Plan.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said this Council endorsed specific deliverables and these numbers reflect what is realistic in terms of the strategic plan.

Upon a motion made by Mayor Benjamin and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted three (3) to one (1) to approve the fiscal year 2014/2015 budget for Economic Development, subject to increasing funding for the World Affairs Council to \$32,500, reducing funding for the Central SC Alliance by \$1,250 and reducing the Economic Development surplus by \$1,250. Voting aye were Mr. Runyan, Mr. Davis and Mayor Benjamin. Mr. Baddourah voted nay.

6. [Fiscal Year 2014 / 2015 Accommodations Tax and Hospitality Tax Funding Recommendations](#) – Ms. Libby Gober, Assistant to City Council

Ms. Libby Gober, Assistant to City Council recalled that City Council requested a list of funding forfeited by organizations. She noted that CMFA (Pocket Productions) will be allowed to carry forward its allocation, because they had not done so previously and that One Columbia no longer has a fiscal agent.

Mayor Benjamin recommended that City Council reinstate funding for the South Carolina State Museum Foundation, the South Carolina Philharmonic, the Greenview Reunion and One Columbia.

Ms. Libby Gober, Assistant to City Council said the remaining funds will go back into the fund balance.

Councilor Davis inquired about the North Columbia Business Association.

Ms. Libby Gober, Assistant to City Council said they did not have enough eligible expenditures to request the funding, but they will carry forward \$12,544.

Councilor Runyan said the rules need to be made clear to the organizations. He agreed to support the recommendation this year, but not going forward.

Councilor Baddourah asked if these agencies meet the Hospitality Tax requirements.

Ms. Libby Gober, Assistant to City Council said yes, but most of them were late sending in the backup.

Upon a motion made by Mayor Benjamin and seconded by Mr. Baddourah, Council voted unanimously to reinstate funding for the South Carolina State Museum Foundation, the South Carolina Philharmonic, the Greenview Reunion and One Columbia.

Ms. Libby Gober, Assistant to City Council presented the recommendations from the Accommodations Tax Advisory Committee to only fund the Columbia Metropolitan Conventions & Visitors Bureau and Capital City Lake Murray Country Regional Tourism.

Mayor Benjamin said we want to continue to make sure that more and more of our hospitality tax funds go to our arts and cultural organizations and that's only going to happen if we continue to force ourselves in that direction. He said we want to very respectful and differential to the work that our wonderful volunteers do to make these decisions. He recommended that City Council allocate an additional \$325,000 from the fiscal year 2013/2014 anticipated surplus in the Hospitality Tax Fund to the Hospitality Tax Advisory Committee; direct the committee not to just look at the organizations with pending requests, but to look anew at the issues of diversity and funding and work very aggressively to meet those needs; and direct the committee to meet with other community members to hear their concerns.

- **Councilor Devine returned to the meeting at 3:02 p.m.**

Ms. Libby Gober, Assistant to City Council asked if Council wanted the committee to consider requests that were received without applications. She asked about a timeline for the committee to reconvene.

Mayor Benjamin noted that the Columbia Metropolitan Conventions & Visitors Bureau requested funding for half of the security costs to open up the State Capitol every Saturday. He noted that the State Department of Parks Recreation and Tourism has agreed to fund half of the cost to make that happen and we have been asked to fund the other half at \$15,000.

Ms. Libby Gober, Assistant to City Council said the money will go to the Historic Columbia Foundation, instead of the Conventions & Visitors Bureau.

Mayor Benjamin suggested that the groups requesting funding submit an application; a process needs to be developed for those who want their previous applications considered; and the committee should meet as soon as possible.

Councilor Devine asked Ms. Gober to confirm if organizations received more than they requested when considering the Council allocations and the committee recommendations.

Ms. Libby Gober, Assistant to City Council noted that approximately \$41,000 will return to the fund from the forfeited allocations.

Councilor Baddourah asked about the policy Council adopted that required organizations to submit applications.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager explained that it pertained to requests submitted after April 29, 2014.

Mayor Benjamin suggested that we issue a Notice of Funds Available for Community Promotions funding during the winter or early spring so that it runs concurrent with our fiscal year 2015/2016 budget process. He said we should set aside \$175,000 to \$200,000 for that formal application process.

Ms. Libby Gober, Assistant to City Council reminded Council that the Accommodations Tax Advisory Committee recommends that any surplus in the Accommodations Tax Fund be divided between the Columbia Metropolitan Conventions and Visitors Bureau and Capital City Lake Murray Country Regional Tourism Board.

Upon a motion made by Mayor Benjamin and seconded by Mr. Runyan, Council voted four (4) to one (1) to approve the recommendation of funding for line item organizations and to add both the South Carolina Philharmonic in the amount of \$100,000 per year and Famously Hot New Year in the amount of \$130,000 (\$80,000 from Hospitality Tax and \$50,000 from Accommodations Tax) as line items in the budget. Voting aye were Mr. Runyan, Ms. Devine, Mr. Davis and Mayor Benjamin. Mr. Baddourah voted nay.

Upon a motion made by Mayor Benjamin and seconded by Mr. Baddourah, Council voted unanimously to approve an additional \$325,000 from the fiscal year 2013/2014 Hospitality Tax surplus to the Hospitality Tax Advisory Committee for dispensation with a request to come back to City Council with their recommendations. The committee members were asked to review applications with great attention to diversity and to consult with former committee member Dr. John Dozier of the University of South Carolina.

Mayor Benjamin made a motion to approve the list of hospitality tax and accommodations tax funding recommendations with the following amendments:

Palmetto Opera	\$16,000
City Center Partnership	\$25,000
Eau Claire Community Council	\$11,250
River Alliance	\$26,000
Township Foundation	\$20,000
Irmo Fire Foundation	\$5,000
Devine Street Merchants Association	\$5,000
Historic Columbia (<i>State Capitol security</i>)	\$15,000

Councilor Davis seconded the motion.

Councilor Devine said she supports the committee and the process and they do a very good job. She can't support the motion, because Council should not change the recommendations; the committee should be able to do that.

Mayor Benjamin said the list is more of a consensus. He asked the committee to give all applications equal consideration whether they received supplemental funding or not.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Director of the Budget & Program Management Office said when the budget was presented to Council, we proposed a hospitality tax budget at the levels of previous funding and there is \$796,000 of unallocated funds in the budget that has been adopted. She reported that the budget assumes that none of the funding was forfeited. She noted that the \$40,231 of forfeited funds will be added back to the fund balance. She recommended that Council not allocate anything beyond the \$796,000.

Ms. Libby Gober, Assistant to City Council clarified that \$80,000 is coming from the Accommodations Tax Fund; should that remain there or come from the \$796,000.

Mayor Benjamin said we also have the forfeited dollars.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Director of the Budget & Program Management Office said the forfeited dollars and those groups with funds going forward have already been accounted for in the budget; the prior year carry forward assumes that none of those funds were forfeited; I will reduce that amount; and add the \$40,000 back to the fund balance.

Mayor Benjamin said he would rather use hospitality tax funding and the forfeited dollars to meet the needs and use the accommodations tax funding to divide between the Columbia Metropolitan Conventions and Visitors Bureau and Capital City Lake Murray Country Regional Tourism Board.

Upon a motion made by Mayor Benjamin and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted three (3) to two (2) to approve the list of hospitality tax and accommodations tax funding recommendations with the understanding that the \$325,000 for the Hospitality Tax Advisory Committee and funding for the following groups will come from the \$796,000 that remains in the current year's budget for Council allocations. Voting aye were Mr. Baddourah, Mr. Davis and Mayor Benjamin. Voting nay were Mr. Runyan and Ms. Devine.

Palmetto Opera	\$16,000
City Center Partnership	\$25,000
Eau Claire Community Council	\$11,250
River Alliance	\$26,000
Township Foundation	\$20,000
Irmo Fire Foundation	\$5,000
Devine Street Merchants Association	\$5,000
Historic Columbia (<i>State Capitol security</i>)	\$15,000

8. [Greenview Park Master Plan and Pool](#) – Mr. Jeff Caton, Director of the Parks and Recreation Department

Mr. Jeff Caton, Director of the Parks and Recreation Department reported that the consultants have worked with the City to conduct community meetings and steering committee meetings in order to collect the information they will be sharing today as well as a proposed design for the pool facility at Greenview Park.

Mr. Mark Hatchel, Senior Park Planner at Kimley-Horn and Associates, Inc. agreed that they went through a lengthy process over the past year with community meetings with the Greenview Community and is here to present the findings of what the community asked us to bring forward to you in our last public meeting.

Mr. Kevin Post, Principal and Studio Director at Counsilman-Hunsinger said the purpose is to walk through the feasibility master plan process and to present the community recommendations. He said the focus was on an aquatics facility, noting that the pool has been closed. He said the first step was to develop a concept through meetings with staff, a steering committee and the public; the next step was to conduct a financial impact study to determine the revenue and expenses for the selected option; and the final step is the report to City Council. He said the committee wanted them to look at the idea of developing a competitive venue, but we found that it was not an appropriate location for such a facility and that it should focus on the needs of the neighborhood. He said the key priority should be to replace the pool. He presented the park master plan and the community preferred option for a multi-generational pool area to include two (2) family water slides; a six (6) lane competition pool; a large leisure pool with shallow water and

play features; and shade and seating. He anticipated that there would be 25,103 visits during the summer and the facility could cover 90% of its direct operating costs. He recommended that scholarships and reduced frequent user fees be implemented and that there be a \$5 admission rate. He presented a proposed project schedule with an anticipated opening date of July 4, 2015.

Councilor Runyan asked what was included in the expenses.

Mr. Kevin Post, Principal and Studio Director at Counsilman-Hunsinger said it included everything for the direct operation of the facility.

Councilor Runyan asked how many personnel are needed.

Mr. Kevin Post, Principal and Studio Director at Counsilman-Hunsinger said five (5) at once, but a total of twenty (20) staff are needed.

Councilor Runyan asked if it would be a contract for service arrangement; how do you have cost containment.

Mr. Kevin Post, Principal and Studio Director at Counsilman-Hunsinger noted that the overhead costs are included.

Mr. Jeff Caton, Director of the Parks and Recreation Department said the previous guard staff and pool staff are still included in the budget and they are treated as seasonal staff.

Councilor Runyan asked how other municipalities handle that.

Mr. Kevin Post, Principal and Studio Director at Counsilman-Hunsinger said the trend is moving towards outsourcing the operations, but we can discuss and work through that within six (6) to eight (8) months prior to the opening date.

Mayor Benjamin asked if the discounts are included in the pro-forma.

Mr. Kevin Post, Principal and Studio Director at Counsilman-Hunsinger said revenue assumes group programming, seasonal passes, \$3 for children and the scholarships.

Mayor Benjamin asked how this compares to the fee structure at Maxcy Gregg Park.

Mr. Jeff Caton, Director of the Parks and Recreation Department said it is comparable.

Councilor Davis said they respect the fact that this is a neighborhood park and those contiguous to the park will use it the most. He expects that no kid that lives in that community will be turned back.

Mr. Kevin Post, Principal and Studio Director at Counsilman-Hunsinger noted that any pool that recaptures 60% to 80% is successful; there is room to reduce that rate. He said we need to reach out to the community to determine what the appropriate range should be.

Mayor Benjamin said his children are Greenview Dolphins and everyone is excited. He wants to be sure that we are sensitive to the costs. He noted that funding has been appropriated to move forward aggressively.

Mr. Mark Hatchel, Senior Park Planner at Kimley-Horn and Associates, Inc. said the new six-lane pool sits where the old pool sat; we are not taking out any other facilities; we will get close to the playground, but we don't plan to impact the tennis courts or the playground with this plan. He said if there were something that necessitated redoing the playground, there are provisions for that in the master plan, but the intent is to not do that. He noted that a new bathhouse and filtration building are being proposed; this will create an exterior entrance and relieve some of the pressure on the desk and the existing activity center. He stated that it works well for that location.

Councilor Devine asked if the drainage issues can be improved as this construction is being done.

Mr. Jeff Caton, Director of the Parks and Recreation Department said the plan provides for site assessment and those issues will be addressed during the preliminary work as they move towards the final construction drawings and design work.

Mr. S. Allison Baker, Senior Assistant City Manager recalled that the entire storm water system was upgraded when the tennis facility was constructed; this won't have a negative impact.

Councilor Davis announced that the bid for the Easter Street ditch improvements will be released soon. He asked that the consultants get with our engineers about the Easter Street ditch project.

Councilor Baddourah asked how many homes are in the community.

Mr. Kevin Post, Principal and Studio Director at Counsilman-Hunsinger said it will serve residents within a three (3) to five (5) mile radius and other county residents.

7. Request for Proposals for the Regional Coordination of Homeless Services in the Midlands – Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager recalled that City Council asked staff to bring the Request for Proposals (RFP) for the Regional Coordination of Homeless Services in the Midlands back today for your discussion.

Councilor Davis said he has looked it and it is alright to move forward, but down the road, we should look at how we can bring in partners who can help to relieve the load on the City; it's not just a city problem.

Ms. Elizabeth Marks, member of the Request for Information Review Panel said they are here today to answer questions, because there has been a lot of misinformation about whether or not the RFP matched our work product in the committee. She said the panel's

consensus by email and telephone was that the RFP was an exceptional match of the RFI panel's work product; we thought that staff and Central Midlands did an outstanding job. She said they didn't put a cost in the RFP, because they were looking for creative solutions and felt as though people would come within a dollar of that number. She said if the City is comfortable with putting a number out there, then we are comfortable with that, too. She said it was a really productive committee.

Pastor Jimmy Jones, Christ Central Ministries said he was a part of the committee that helped to develop the RFP. He said there wasn't consensus on the fact that it would be the City's responsibility to fund the RFP, the coordinator and the different things requested in it and it is limiting to require the awardee to be a HUD certified continuum care provider, because there aren't many in South Carolina. He hoped that we would draw a broader audience through the RFP. He said the document is one of the best he has ever seen; it covers a lot of territory; and it certainly brings together a lot of the different things that are facing our community when dealing with homeless services.

Ms. Ashley Thomas, Staff Attorney at South Carolina Appleseed Legal Justice Center and a member of the Request for Information Review Panel responded that those items were not specifically discussed by the panel.

Ms. Deborah Boone, Coordinator of Homeless Services for Richland School District One's students and families and a member of the Request for Information Review Panel noted that the meetings were recorded and a transcript can be provided.

Councilor Baddourah asked the City Manager to define the city's funding requirement.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said this is Council's decision; staff was already very clear that we were facilitating the process; there was a literal take of the information that was provided by the panel. She said we have to go through a procurement process with this RFP and we were directed to work with the Central Midlands Council of Governments. She insisted that the approach is for the coordination of the services; the City of Columbia isn't a social service provider; there has to be facilitation with service providers. She said it then becomes the prerogative of this Council if you decide to spend no dollars on the coordination of services. She noted that approximately \$400,000 is left for homeless services, but the best approach is not to tell a responder how much you intend to spend. She said if it is your preference to be specific, we will adjust the document to add a not to exceed amount; that is not typically what we do when we release an RFP or a RFQ.

Councilor Baddourah said we can take other steps if we don't agree with what we receive; we can adjust our strategies. He said he has no problem with moving forward and seeing what responses we receive.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager clarified that the document was meant to be broad and Council asked that the Homeless Management Information System (HMIS) be used to track the homeless population in Columbia.

Councilor Davis agreed that a dollar amount should not be included and the continuum of care should be included. He said part of the goal is for us not to assume full responsibility; there is a role for everybody to play or we will be right where we are ten (10) years from now.

Councilor Runyan said there are a couple of inconsistencies with what's actually in the document. He said if it is the will of Council to proceed, he will yield to the will of the majority of Council; we will see how it works out at the end of the day. He stated the following for the record: *"Under the funding section, it says all funding requirements will be the responsibility of the City of Columbia. That is the whole sentence. That is the whole scope of where funding is going to come from under this document. I think this moves us in the opposite direction from the amazing territory that we were able to cover in the past nine (9) months. I think it is worth noting that by leveraging the power of the church, by leveraging the power of the business community, by leveraging the power of hundreds and hundreds and hundreds of volunteers at no cost to taxpayers, we were able to help fifteen hundred (1,500) folks. Almost fourteen hundred (1,400) of them are onto help and other programs and for the first time ever, ever, every single program in the region was running when the shelter shut down at 100% capacity. There were zero vacant beds and the reason that worked is because it was collaborative and because it brought all the various players in the community together around a shared goal. This document sets out a contract for service, which is completely opposite of what we have shown to work for the past few years and to work to great effect. And I think if you talk to some of your business owners downtown they can probably attest to that. So let me just hit a few points that I think Council just needs to be aware of before we vote. Number one of course was the funding issue. Number two is that this goes really in the opposite direction of what we have done in the past two (2) years and the progress that has been made if Council were to seek to hire someone to fulfill the response. The targeted population in here is quite broad; it's far broader than what we saw at the winter shelter and emergency shelter. I would anticipate that the cost therefore will be much higher and I believe that staff's estimate for running the emergency shelter was roughly three million dollars (\$300,000,000) to run it in the capacity that we did. I know that was Mrs. Livingston's spreadsheet that she put out before we engaged with Christ Central Ministries to run the shelter and so we're talking about a significant amount of money from that standpoint. The six (6) homeless goals that this body adopted unanimously, you might say twice, but certainly once, are listed in here once and there is no accountability back to those goals. HMIS, Ms. Wilson on Page 16 as you alluded to, is a requirement and is listed here as the HMIS which I'm assuming is the HMIS run by the United Way and so that mandates utilization of a system that we must then pay for at the benefit of an organization in this area. Transportation is a requirement of this RFP and the emergency shelter did ninety thousand (90,000) transports from the emergency shelter. Just that piece alone could be expected to cost about two hundred and fifty thousand dollars (\$250,000) of the four hundred and fifty (\$450,000) that I believe that we have available if we are contracting for service with someone. Page 18 says that public and private funding should be utilized, but it is not required, because the City is the default funder for everything. Page 20, second to last paragraph, COG makes the decision selecting the successful respondent. So the COG gets to decide who wins and the City gets to pay for it. Page 21, Award Criteria: only 20% goes toward whether or not they can actually*

perform services that they claim to be able or will claim to be able to deliver. And then quite interestingly, as was mentioned, you must be a lead agency recognized as a federal continuum of care agency by HUD. There is only one agency in this region that qualifies for that, so this has in essence eliminated everyone else. Timeline is only 10%, which seems for an urgent problem that it would be much more pressing. I really could continue to go on and on; I'm not going to. I will point out as you get to the last couple of pages that there is a place here to list all the costs to the City. We have to pay for HMIS, we have to pay for housing, we have to pay for transportation, we have to pay for food sharing and meal services, we have to pay for coordinators and service providers, we have to pay for a coordinator for the homeless; we are basically paying for a whole lot of stuff that we had built up an enormous infrastructure with the community, leveraging the power of the community and the humanity of this City and the humanity of the church. If y'all want to put this out, that's fine. I think it is a road to ruin. I believe it goes in the opposite direction again of what we have demonstrated over the past couple of years to work, understanding that what we've done the past couple of years has been a bit of a U-turn from what has historically been done. I don't think this gets us where we need to be, but again I will yield to the will of the majority of Council on it. So thank you. And Madame Clerk if you would just make sure my comments are recorded as spoken."

Councilor Davis said there is room to get us off that point down the road; we can all agree on the concerns about costs to the City. He said he reviewed the document and he honed in on the deliverables; the expected outcomes are there. He said it is a question of how we get there; what are the responsibilities; and which parties are identified to make certain things happen. He said if we can make that one of the launching points for whoever gets the contract, this will put some structure to all of this. He said let the RFP be the charge to whatever the point of coordination is. He spent four (4) days driving in the downtown area of Charleston and he didn't see any homeless folks. He insisted that there is something you can do right. He acknowledged that he doesn't know who is responsible for the homeless services in Charleston, but it can be documented and proven that if other organizations do what they are supposed to do, our costs will be less. He suggested that we monitor how those costs are being shared on a regular basis.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said we were directed not to edit the document; Council was supposed to submit their proposed changes, but she hasn't received any. She said if that sentence on page 25 regarding funding causes concerns, it can be stricken. She said this is Council's directive to us.

Councilor Baddourah said he understands Mr. Runyan's concern with that statement, but page 31 indicates that the City can terminate this contract at any point.

Councilor Devine said this is the RFP and additional action will be required.

Councilor Runyan said the point is that this goes in the opposite direction of what we have shown demonstratively can work; this does nothing to build on the goodwill of the community and the leveraging of resources; the City funding it is a symptom of a larger problem. He suggested that award criteria 2c be removed, because MACH is the only agency that would qualify.

Mr. Bob Wynn, President of the Arsenal Hill Neighborhood Association and a member of the Request for Information Review Panel insisted that this is not a road to ruin; the approach here has been to assist the City and find the best practices available and bring together an understanding of how this City would like to move forward. He said the experience of the shelter being open for seven (7) months as a pilot project has proven to show a successful capability within this City in that people of all faiths, capabilities and perspectives came together to work towards feeding, sheltering and getting the homeless safely off the streets. He said some of the elements that were lacking were coordinated efforts and data collection that could tell us who was where and what beds were open. He said that HMIS is not solely by one group in this City. He said the COG and staff came up with a consensus that looks at all of the aspects and if we think that the last seven (7) months have cleared us of homeless, we are wrong. He said we need an approach that looks at the continuum of care for all of those people who may come out and be in need. He said this is a coordinated and sensible way for this City to proceed. He said tweak it if you need to, but please move forward with this.

Pastor Jimmy Jones, Christ Central Ministries said HMIS is not one system; many HUD certified systems are available; we bought a system that produces all of the data that Mr. Wynn mentioned. He said he is 100% in support of this document, but he suggested that the language related to funding be amended; it's a false premise to tell a provider that all funding will be provided by the City. He noted that Christ Central isn't bidding on this.

Councilor Baddourah said that nobody communicated concerns with this document to the City Manager and he finds it awkward that all of this is being said now.

Mayor Benjamin said a lot of work has gone into this document and developing a truly community-wide approach in response to the needs. He appreciates all of the work done, realizing that we might have different philosophies, but we must do something and we must do it together.

Upon a motion made by Ms. Devine and seconded by Mr. Baddourah, Council voted four (4) to one (1) to direct staff to issue the Request for Proposals for the Regional Coordination of Homeless Services in the Midlands. Voting aye were Mr. Baddourah, Ms. Devine, Mr. Davis and Mayor Benjamin. Mr. Runyan voted nay.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said they will look at additional items particularly the funding.

9. Wrecker Contract Obligations – Ms. Melissa Gentry, P.E., Assistant City Manager for Operations and Development Services

Ms. Melissa Gentry, P.E., Assistant City Manager for Operations and Development Services said the wrecker ordinance allows certain charges to be assessed by companies on our rotation list, but it doesn't allow them to charge during festival events. She recommended that we now treat those as a regular tow and the companies will tow the vehicles to their lots and charge for doing so. She said with the opening of the HUB, the demand will increase drastically. She said that our partners will be notified and the public

will be notified through social media. She said they wanted to make Council aware of this and they realize they need to make provisions for weekend and nighttime enforcement.

Councilor Davis said he understands the change and doesn't have a problem with it. He said we need to highly publicize this.

10. Billboard Setbacks – The Honorable Cameron A. Runyan – *Consideration of this item was deferred.*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Davis and seconded by Mr. Runyan, Council voted unanimously to adjourn the meeting at 5:00 p.m. Mr. Baddourah was not present for the vote.

Respectfully submitted by:

Erika D. Moore
City Clerk